

## DETROIT LIBRARY COMMISSION

## REGULAR MEETING

MAY 20, 2014

1:30 P.M.

President Hicks called the Regular Meeting of the Detroit Library Commission to order at 1:34 p.m.

Present: President Hicks, Commissioners Bellant, Quarterman, Thomas

Commissioners Jackson and Lemmons joined the meeting at 1:38 p.m.

Administrative Staff: Mondowney, Machie, Bruni, Call, Funchess, Ibegbu, Moore, Myers, Norfolk, Simmons, D. Williams, T. Williams

Excused: Commissioner Inniss-Edwards

Present Also: Cheryl Blessett, Lamont Bolding, Enid Clark, Medgar Clark, Kenya Howard, Mike McElgunn, Patrice Merritt, Carolyn Mosley, Yvette Rice, Carole Rihani, Tiffany Simon

**APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES**

Commissioner Quarterman moved to approve the minutes of the Regular meeting of April 15, 2014. Commissioner Thomas supported. The minutes were approved as presented.

**PUBLIC COMMENTS**

*Carole Rihani*, Librarian II Children's Library – Expressed her concerns regarding the following items:

- Tutoring for students at Main library and all of the branches during the summer months provided by the Detroit Board of Education.

- Accelerated Reader testing at the Detroit Public Library branches with computer access provided by the Detroit Board of Education.
- Shifting the operational hours for the Children's Library from 12:00 p.m. – 8:00 p.m. on Tuesdays and Thursdays to 10:00 a.m. -6:00 p.m. to accommodate more school visits.
- Provide Company Library Cards to all non-resident Detroit Public School teachers to allow them more accessibility in charging out materials for their classrooms.
- Advertising teen and children's library programs on Detroit buses.

### Discussion

President Hicks stated that the President of the Detroit Board of Education, LaMar Lemmons, was also a member of the Detroit Library Commission and he would refer the concerns of tutoring and accelerated reader testing to him.

President Hicks said that the shifting of operational hours for Children's Library would be referred to the Executive Director. He said if the issue was not resolved by the next Commission meeting, he would like an update on the progress of this matter.

President Hicks suggested obtaining a motion to provide Company Cards to all non-resident Detroit Public School teachers without a fee.

### **COMMISSION ACTION**

Commissioner Bellant move to provide Detroit Public School teachers with a library card without a fee and with all of the privileges of a regular library card. Commissioner Lemmons supported. Commissioner Jackson opposed. The motion carried

President Hicks also stated that the advertising programs on Detroit buses would be referred to the administrative staff.

## **REPORT OF THE PRESIDENT**

### **Approval of Memorial Resolution for Mr. General Baker**

President Hicks acknowledged that Mr. General Baker, a longtime labor activist in Detroit, passed away on May 18, 2014. President Hicks presented the following resolution for approval:

## **Resolution Memorializing Mr. General Baker**

**Whereas**, General Baker led a life of commitment to uncompromising social justice, and

**Whereas**, his history of leadership from the era of the League of Revolutionary Black Workers and the positive changes that it generated, to his work for the unemployed, low income and unorganized workers, and

**Whereas**, General Baker educated students on campuses nationally and addressed conferences internationally on the realities of exploitative conditions from a worldwide perspective, therefore be it

**Resolved**, that the Detroit Library Commission sends its condolences to General Baker's family, friends, comrades and all who will be touched by the loss of his encouragement, humility, fearlessness and leadership.

In order to make a motion, President Hicks relinquished chairing the meeting to Vice President Quarterman.

### **COMMISSION ACTION**

President Hicks moved to adopt the resolution memorializing Mr. General Baker. Commissioner Bellant supported. The motion passed unanimously.

President Hicks resumed chairing the meeting.

President Hicks stated that the Detroit Public Library will be embarking on a millage campaign which would include an education component and a campaign component. He reminded Commissioners to submit a list of individuals they would formally like to invite to join the millage campaign.

## **REPORT OF THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR**

### **Millage Update**

Mrs. Mondowney reported that she attended the Detroit City Council's Neighborhood and Community Services Standing Committee on May 1, 2014, to follow up on the DPL millage proposal for the August 5<sup>th</sup> ballot. The Committee moved the proposal to the full Council meeting on May 6<sup>th</sup>, which she also attended. The Council voted to pass a resolution of support and forwarded that resolution to the Detroit Election Commission. On May 15, 2014, she received notification that the Election Commission approved and forwarded the Library's ballot proposal to Wayne County Election Commission.

### **DPL Financial Update**

Mrs. Mondowney reported that DPL received a payment for delinquent property taxes in the amount of \$234,398.

DPL did not have to appear before the City Council to review the FY2015 budget. The hearing was scheduled for May 15, 2014.

### **Meeting with Detroit City Council Member**

Mrs. Mondowney reported that on April 28, 2014, she and Margaret Bruni, Assistant Director of Branch Services met with Council member Saunteel Jenkins to discuss the Library's upcoming millage and its 150<sup>th</sup> anniversary in 2015. Member Jenkins continues to applaud and support the work of DPL.

### **Update on Redford and Douglass Branches**

Mrs. Mondowney reported that the Redford Branch closed to the public on Monday, May 5, 2014, in preparation for renovations. Staff are currently weeding and boxing the collection, cleaning up files, and undertaking other tasks necessary to empty the construction area. Once construction begins, staff will be temporarily re-assigned to other library locations. Some public programs will continue in the Redford community, including a long-standing gardening program that takes place outside of the branch, and a 4-week job preparation program for teens and young adults, which will be hosted at the nearby Chase Branch.

The current Children's Library at the Douglass Branch will close to the public on May 27, 2014, in preparation for its conversion to a computer & technology center. The Library on Wheels and the Library for the Blind and Physically Handicapped, which are also housed at the Douglass Branch, will continue regular service.

Signage and other messaging are directing customers from Redford and Douglass to other nearby library locations. Nearby branch locations for Redford are Chaney, Chase and Hubbard; for Douglass, Duffield and Main.

Minutes were approved at the June 17, 2014 Commission Meeting

### **New Online Requisition System Training**

Mrs. Mondowney reported that the go-live date for SIRE (Store-Index-Retrieve-Exchange), DPL's new online requisition system, is June 2, 2014. DPL's Customer Support Assistants will visit each DPL location to train staff members who will be accessing the system to process requisitions and receive goods. Once this system is implemented DPL will no longer operate a paper-based requisition system. She thanked Mike McElgunn, DPL's purchasing manager and Sharon Bialic, DPL's training specialist, and all of DPL's Customer Support Assistants who are working to make this a successful transition.

### **Edge Initiative**

Mrs. Mondowney reported that the Detroit Public Library accepted an invitation to participate in the Edge Initiative. With funding from the Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation, led by the Urban Libraries Council and supported by the American Library Association, this important initiative is designed to demonstrate that libraries play a critical role in providing access to technology. DPL staff will participate in a series of employee training and development opportunities built on values that prioritize respectful interactions, service oriented attitudes and safe environments for employees and customers.

### **Wayne County Child Support Help Program**

Mrs. Mondowney reported that on Saturday, April 26, 2014, Main Library was the site for the Wayne County Friend of the Court Child Support Help Program. More than 75 people with various child support issues were served by 30 volunteers. The Friend of the Court is appreciative of the Library's support of this program, which has been offered several times at Main Library. The program will be offered again in the fall.

### **Comerica Java & Jazz**

Mrs. Mondowney reported that Naima Shambouger will be the guest vocalist for the Comerica Java & Jazz series on Tuesday, May 20, 2014 at 6 pm. Naima is an accomplished jazz singer who has performed nationwide with a variety of established jazz masters. Comerica Java & Jazz is in its 14<sup>th</sup> season and the events are always well attended.

### **2014 Author Day**

Mrs. Mondowney reported that Sharon Flake was the 2014 Author Day guest on May 13 and May 14 at Main Library. Ms. Flake's book, "Pinned" was the focus of the two-day event where she provided a book talk followed by a lively question and answer session. Author Day is sponsored DPL, the DPL Friends Foundation and the DeRoy Testamentary Fund.

### **Lurine Carter**

Mrs. Mondowney congratulated Ms. Lurine Carter, Coordinator of Children's Services, who was featured in the May, 2014 edition of BLAC magazine. Mrs. Carter shared her dream for Detroit-"To turn blight into a paradise, to turn tears into laughter, to turn flight from the city to steadfastness; to enable every person to get an education and use it as a passport to see the wonders of the world."

### **Remembrances**

On behalf of DPL, Mrs. Mondowney extended condolences to the family of Jerome Willim, a DPL building engineer, who died on May 3, 2014. Jerome joined the staff of DPL in 2001. Jerome worked at Main Library and was responsible for maintaining the heating and cooling systems.

On behalf of DPL, Mrs. Mondowney also noted the passing of Rosemarie Evenhuis, wife of Jim Evenhuis, retired assistant director of West Side Branch Services and current volunteer archivist, died on May 6, 2014. Many DPL staff members came to know Rosemarie over the years as she often accompanied Jim to library events and served as a judge in the Black History Month essay contest at the Duffield Branch.

### **Comment**

On behalf of the Detroit Library Commission, President Hicks extended condolences to the families of Mr. Jerome Willim and Mrs. Rosemarie Evenhuis.

## **FRIENDS FOUNDATION UPDATE**

Ms. Merritt reported that the Friends fiscal year ended April 30, 2014. The Foundation has a commitment from Cole, Newton and Duran for audit services with completion slated for August 2014. The audit will be presented to The Friends Board for approval at the September meeting and then it will be given to the DPL as it has in the past.

Ms. Merritt reported that the grant report for FY 2013 – 2014 was distributed to the Commission. Ms. Merritt noted that there were 9 first time donors to the DPL. She said sustaining them as donors was paramount.

Ms. Merritt reported that the Coleman A. Young processing is ahead of schedule with the archivists presently processing the years 1990 – 1991. She has spoken with Dr. Sandra Yee, Dean of Libraries at WSU and a Friends member about giving DPL the final year of mayoral papers that were placed on deposit at the Reuther Library. Dr. Yee agreed that the entire collection should be together and plans are underway for a deed of gift and transfer to be implemented this summer. As Mayor Young's legislative papers are also at the Reuther Library, Dean Yee will investigate, should circumstances allow, also placing those papers at DPL, again wanting to keep the Mayor's legacy at one location. The Friends Foundation would like to publicly acknowledge appreciation for Dr. Yee's assistance.

Ms. Merritt reported that she is presently applying for operational funding from the Kresge Foundation and the Erb Family Foundation. If successful, both grants will provide operating funding for the next two years totaling approximately \$70,000.

Ms. Merritt showcased a few pop-up books that were recently given to The Friends Foundation. She will share these books with the Burton Historical Collection staff for consideration as acquisitions for the rare book collection.

### **COMMITTEE ON ADMINISTRATION**

#### **Approval of Human Resources Routine Report**

Commissioner Lemmons reported that the Human Resources Department Report provides information regarding personnel actions taken from April 1, 2014 – April 30, 2014. These actions have been approved by Administration.

#### **APPOINTMENTS (0)**

#### **RETIREMENTS (0)**

Employee Name	Last Day Worked	Retirement Date
---------------	-----------------	-----------------

#### **SICK LEAVE PAYOUTS (0)**

#### **POTENTIAL RETIREMENTS (0)**

Minutes were approved at the June 17, 2014 Commission Meeting

**SEPARATIONS (2)**

Customer Service Representative(s)

**EMPLOYEE HEADCOUNT**

Headcount – April 2014	Headcount – April 2013
329 Active Employees	340 Employees

**COMMISSION ACTION**

Commissioner Lemmons moved to approve the Human Resources Routine Report. Commissioner Bellant supported. The motion passed unanimously.

**Approval to Modify Library Hours at Wilder/Lincoln and Chandler Park/Monteith Branches**

Commissioner Lemmons reported that in March 2012, the Detroit Library Commission approved the reduction of service hours at Wilder and Chandler Park branches, in order to accommodate the reopening of Lincoln and Monteith branches. Wilder was paired with Lincoln and Chandler Park was paired with Monteith branch. Each pair is open for 40 hours per week and is operated by the same team of staff.

The number of hours that each library is open to the public is rotated every week, as follows:

<b>Week One</b>	<b># of Hours Open</b>	<b>Week Two</b>	<b># of Hours Open</b>
Wilder	24	Lincoln	24
Lincoln	16	Wilder	16
Chandler Park	24	Monteith	24
Monteith	16	Chandler Park	16

This rotation means that one branch is open on one Saturday and closed the next Saturday and also closed on a fifth Saturday. Our review after two years of operating this model suggest that the customers at these four branches would be better served with a more consistent model. We are proposing that the parent branches (Wilder & Chandler Park) are open each week for 24 hours, while Lincoln and Monteith branches are open consistently for 16 hours per week. The library hours for the branches would be as follows:



<b>Library</b>	<b># of Hours Open</b>	<b>Days Open</b>
Wilder	24	<i>W, Th &amp; Sat (or Fri.)</i>
Lincoln	16	<i>M &amp; T</i>
Chandler Park	24	<i>W, Th &amp; Sat (or Fri.)</i>
Monteith	16	<i>M &amp; T</i>

### **COMMISSION ACTION**

Commissioner Lemmons moved to modify hours at Wilder/Lincoln and Chandler Park/Monteith branches. Commissioner Bellant supported. The motion passed unanimously. The hours will be effective after May 26, 2014.

### **Approval to Revise the Language of the Language of the Detroit Library Commission Rules and Regulations Under "D3-Purchase Authority"**

#### **D. PURCHASES AND PAYMENTS**

**Proposed Language:** Any Commissioner or Library employee who willfully causes unauthorized encumbrances on the Library can be held personally liable for those costs and the DLC can pursue collection as it sees fit.

**Revised Language:** The Commission intends to prevent any unauthorized encumbrances on the library. If such cases do occur, the Commission will investigate, assess liability and pursue collection as it sees fit.

### **COMMISSION ACTION**

After taking a three minutes recess to discuss the revised language, the following action was taken:

Commissioner Lemmons moved to approve the revised language. Commissioner Bellant supported. Commissioner Jackson abstained. The motion passed.

### **Approval of the Resolution Re-Affirming Detroit Public Library Procedure for Entering Contracts**

Commissioner Lemmons read the following resolution:

**Whereas**, the Detroit Library Commission seeks to re-affirm its policy for awarding contracts on behalf of the Detroit Public Library, and

**Whereas**, the Detroit Library Commission revised its Purchasing Policy and adopted this revision on December 15, 2009, now

**Now**, be it therefore resolved that the Detroit Library Commission re-affirms this Purchasing Policy which requires that purchases in excess of \$10,000 must be presented to and approved by the Detroit Library Commission; and

**Be** it further resolved that no Detroit Public Library employee can nor should issue an order to proceed or order to work without a Commission-approved contract; and

**Be** it further resolved that in the event any DPL employee forces DPL into a contractual relationship without appropriate approval or a contract, there shall automatically be a review by the Human Resources Department on the conduct of the DPL employee.

### **COMMISSION ACTION**

Commissioner Lemmons moved to approve the resolution. Commissioner Bellant supported. The motion passed unanimously.

### **Approval of the 2014/2015 Annual Calendar of Library Closings and Schedule Changes**

Commissioner Lemmons reported that the calendar runs from July 1, 2014 to June 30, 2015.

July 4, 2014 (Friday)	Independence Day
August 30, 2014 (Saturday)	Designated Holiday (Labor Day) For Main Public Service Agencies
September 1, 2014 (Monday)*	Labor Day For Branches and Support Agencies
October 1, 2014 (Wednesday)	Staff Day
November 11, 2014 (Tuesday)	Veterans Day
November 27, 2014 (Thursday)	Thanksgiving Day
November 28, 2014 (Friday)	Day After Thanksgiving Main & Support Agencies
November 29, 2014 (Saturday)	Designated Holiday (Day After Thanksgiving) For Branch Agencies
December 24, 2014 (Wednesday)	Christmas Eve
December 25, 2014 (Thursday)	Christmas Day
December 31, 2014 (Wednesday)	New Year's Eve

Minutes were approved at the June 17, 2014 Commission Meeting

January 1, 2015 (Thursday)	New Year's Day
January 17, 2015 (Saturday)	Designated Holiday (Martin Luther King, Jr. (Day) For Main Public Service Agencies
January 19, 2015 (Monday)	Martin Luther King, Jr. Day
February 14, 2015 (Saturday)	Designated Holiday (President's Day For Main Public Service Agencies
February 16, 2015 (Monday)	President's Day
April 3, 2015 (Friday)	Good Friday
April 4, 2015 (Saturday)	Designated Holiday (Good Friday) For Branch Agencies
May 23, 2015 (Saturday)**	Designated Holiday (Memorial Day) For Main Public Service Agencies
May 25, 2015 (Monday)	Memorial Day For Branches and Public Support Agencies
<hr/>	
*September 5-6, 2014 (Friday – Saturday)	Branch Fall Schedule Begins (Closed Fridays, Open Saturdays)
**May 22-23, 2015 (Friday – Saturday)	Branch Summer Schedule Begins (Open Fridays, Closed Saturdays)

## **COMMISSION ACTION**

Commissioner Lemmons moved to approve the 2014/2015 annual calendar of library closings and schedule changes. Commissioner Bellant supported. The motion passed unanimously.

### **Approval of the Exceptions to A Hiring Freeze Policy**

Commissioner Lemmons read the following proposed policy:

#### **1.0 Purpose:**

In the event of a Commission approved hiring freeze, the Administration of the Detroit Public Library (DPL) is obligated to hire and fill *mission driven* positions that sustain the integrity and safety of public service and business operations.

#### **2.0 Applicability:**

Any funded position deemed “critical” and thus, exempt from the hiring freeze must satisfy one of the following requirements:

1. A position critical to supporting the core functions of the Library where a vacancy will result in the disruption in daily operations or the elimination of core services.
2. A position related to the protection and well-being of the staff and/or the public.
3. A position that, if left unfilled, will cause a liability for the Library.
4. A position that is critical to the advancement of the library mission and revenue generating ability.

### **3.0 Exceptions to the Hiring Freeze:**

1. Promotions are not subject to the hiring freeze, and therefore, librarian, administrative and staff positions may be posted for internal recruitment only.
2. Appointments to Acting positions and temporary transfers will continue per the language of the union contracts.
3. Positions that are grant-funded and required to maintain compliance with the grant.
4. The Pre-Pro librarian position per the labor contract.

### **4.0 Process:**

1. The Executive Director or his/her designee may deem a position “critical” and, thus, exempted from the hiring freeze.
2. Human Resources/Payroll Services must present a justification and proof of budget to support a request for critical hire. The justification should include:
  - How is the position critical to the mission and operations of the Library?
  - What are the consequences if the position is not filled?
  - Where will the funds for this position come from?
  - What are labor contract implications, if any?
  - Are there other options to fill this critical need?

*While the above are intended as guidelines, whether a position is ultimately determined to be “critical” will depend on the totality of factors cited in the submitted justification.*

### **5.0 Over-time and other compensation**

1. All department heads are charged with ensuring that their departments are operating in the most cost effective manner – including reviewing the use of over-time.

### **6.0 Related Polices**

N/A

### **COMMISSION ACTION**

Commissioner Lemmons moved to approve the exceptions to a hiring freeze policy. Commissioner Bellant supported.

#### **Discussion**

President Hicks amendment to the motion was in the event of the Executive Director or his/her designee deeming a position "critical" and, thus, exempted from the hiring freeze, a report on this action should be presented to the Commission at its next regular meeting.

Commissioner Quarterman's amendment to the motion was that the Executive Director should have the authority to approve all overtime requests.

### **COMMISSION ACTION CONT'D**

Commissioner Lemmons restated the motion with the amendments. Commissioner Bellant supported. The motion passed unanimously.

#### **Authorization to Approve the Phased Implementation of the Classification Study (Title Changes)**

Commissioner Lemmons reported that subsequent to the March 19, 2013 approval of the title change and salary adjustments for the Clerical Assistants, HR is submitting the remaining recommended title changes resulting from the FY2010/2011 Compensation and Classification Study (conducted by Public Sector Personnel Associates) for review and approval.

Based on the survey results the "Library is a competitive employer" (within 5% of the prevailing rates);

253 employees are below the midpoint, but above the minimum, unlike the Clerical Assistants who were -19.26% below the midpoint. As such, it is not anticipated that salary rate adjustments will be made at this time for other classifications.

<b><i>EXISTING TITLE</i></b>	<b><i>TITLE CHANGE PER THE STUDY</i></b>	<b><i>DEPARTMENT</i></b>
Customer Support Assistant	Technical Training Associate	All Agencies/Branches
Clerk	Office Support Assistant I	Closed Departments

Minutes were approved at the June 17, 2014 Commission Meeting

Clerk	Senior Customer Representative	All Agencies/Branches
Senior Clerk	Office Support Assistant II Collection Services Assistant Finance Assistant	Closed Department
Senior Voucher Clerk	Finance Assistant, Senior	Closed Department
Technical Services Assistant	Technical Services Assistant Digital Services Assistant	Technical Lab
Clerical Assistant	Customer Services Representative (Commission Approved 3/19/2013)	All Agencies/Branches
Janitor	Custodian	All Agencies/Branches
Security Guard	Security Officer	All Agencies/Branches
Manager, Circulation	<i>TITLE WILL REMAIN THE SAME</i>	Main
Manager, Technical Processing	<i>TITLE WILL REMAIN THE SAME</i>	Technical Processing
Assistant Manager, Circulation	<i>TITLE WILL REMAIN THE SAME</i>	Main
Assistant Manager, Technical Processing	<i>TITLE WILL REMAIN THE SAME</i>	Technical Processing
<b>LIBRARIANS</b>		
Librarian IV – Branch Manager	Library-Branch Manager	All Departments/Agencies
Librarian IV – Manager, Adult Services	Library- Department Manager, Adult Services	All Departments/Agencies
Librarian IV – Manager, Children and Youth Services	Library- Department Manager, Children and Youth Services	All Departments/Agencies
Coordinator for TIP/Special Services, etc.	Library Coordinator	All Departments/Agencies
<b>ALL ADMINISTRATIVE POSITION TITLES WILL REMAIN THE SAME</b>		

New job descriptions will be distributed to all DPL employees once Commission approves the title changes.

Minutes were approved at the June 17, 2014 Commission Meeting

## **COMMISSION ACTION**

Commissioner Lemmons moved to approve the phased implementation of the classification study (title changes). Commissioner Quarterman supported. The motion passed unanimously.

## **AUDIT COMMITTEE**

### **Approval of Detroit Public Library Financial Statements**

Commissioner Ballant summarized the Detroit Public Library statements that were submitted by Abraham & Gaffney, P.C. – Certified Public Accountants. He stated that Mr. Aaron Stevens, CPA, had reviewed the entire report with the Audit Committee and it was accepted by the committee as presented.

## **COMMISSION ACTION**

Commissioner Bellant moved to approve the Detroit Public Library statements as presented. Commission Lemmons supported. The motion passed unanimously.

### **Approval of Proposal for a Financial Audit of Accounts of the Detroit Public Library for the Fiscal Year Ending June 30, 2014.**

A Request for Proposal (RFP) for a financial audit of the Detroit Public Library accounts was sent to twelve (12) auditing firms. The RFP was advertised in the Detroit Legal News and Detroit Public Library Website. In addition, sixty-eight (68) firms were informed of this RFP through a posting on Michigan Intergovernmental Technical Network (MITN). The RFP included a section on the evaluation criteria by Library administration enabling all bidders to be cognizant of those criteria.

The following firms, with corresponding cost and evaluative values, responded to the RFP:

<b>Audit Firm</b>	<b>Cost</b>	<b>Evaluative Value</b>
Alan C. Young and Assoc. 7310 Woodward Avenue, Suite 740, Detroit, MI 48202	\$44,800	95
Gabridge & Company 3940 Peninsular Drive SE, Suite 130, Grand Rapids, MI 49546	\$46,620	75
Rehmann Group 719 Griswold St. Suite 280, Detroit MI 48226	\$47,550	91
Abraham & Gaffney, P.C. 3511 Coolidge Road, Suite 100, East Lansing, MI 48823	\$51,000	98

Minutes were approved at the June 17, 2014 Commission Meeting

Out of the twelve (12) mailed RFPs, bids were not received from the following firms:

1. Baker, Tilly, Virchow, Krause, One Town Square, Suite 600, Southfield, MI 48076
2. BDO Seidman LLP - 755 West Big Beaver, Suite 1900, Troy MI 48084-0178
3. Cole, Newton & Duran, 33133 Schoolcraft, Livonia, MI 48150
4. George Johnson & Company - 243 West Congress, Suite 1080, Detroit, MI 48226
5. Glen Olivache CPA - 220 Bagley Avenue, Suite 400, Detroit MI 48226
6. Gregory Terrell & Co. - Buhl Building, 535 Griswold, Suite 2000, Detroit, MI 48226
7. Martin, Arrington, Desai, and Meyers - 1010 Ford Building, 615 Griswold, Detroit, MI 48226
8. Plante Moran, 7310 Woodward Avenue, Detroit, MI 48202

The firms were evaluated by an evaluation team (team) consisting of members of the business office. The team examined each firm according to criteria stated in the RFP. The team examined responsiveness to the RFP and demonstration of clear understanding of the work to be performed. Additional criteria included: appropriateness and adequacy of proposed procedures such as necessity of procedures, realistic time estimates for completion of the audit, and appropriateness of the assigned staff levels. The team reviewed the technical experience of each firm related to clients with the following characteristics: work with not-for-profit corporations, governmental units and relevant experience for Detroit Public Library. The team reviewed the qualifications and experience of management and audit staff assigned to the audit. These include position(s) in the firm, years and type of managerial and audit experience, and overall supervision to be exercised. The cost of the audit was also a consideration in the evaluation. The team submitted its recommendations to the Audit Committee. The Audit Committee made the final selection.

**Gabridge & Company** The bidder was not responsive to information requested in RFP. The overall evaluation by the team was the lowest due to of lack of information to effectively compare the RFP to the other bidding firms.

**Rehmann Group** The bidder has experience with many municipalities and public libraries in three states: Florida, Ohio, and Michigan but the audit fees were the third largest. The overall evaluation by panel was ranked third.

**Abraham & Gaffney** Audit fees were all inclusive and would not be adjusted for additional services performed during the audit. The overall evaluation by the team was ranked the highest. However, the bidder has exceeded the seven (7) year audit term limit established by the Detroit Library Commission's Audit Committee. This puts the bidder beyond consideration for fiscal year 2014 audit engagement.

**Alan C. Young & Associates, P.C.** The bidder provides the best combination of experience, resources, qualifications, and price to complete the audit as required. The bidder was ranked second by the team.

The evaluation team therefore, recommends that Alan C. Young & Associates, P.C. be engaged for an amount not to exceed \$44,800 to complete a financial audit of the Detroit Public Library for the year ending June 30, 2014.

Minutes were approved at the June 17, 2014 Commission Meeting



## **COMMISSION ACTION**

Commissioner Quarterman moved to approve Alan C. Young & Associates, P.C. to conduct a financial audit of accounts of the Detroit Public Library for the fiscal year ending June 30, 2014. Commissioner Lemmons supported. Commissioner Bellant opposed. Commissioner Jackson abstained. The motion passed.

### **Approval of Proposal for a Financial Audit of Burton Endowment Fund for the Fiscal Year Ending June 30, 2014.**

A Request for Quote (RFQ) for a financial audit of Burton Endowment Fund was sent to twelve (12) auditing firms. The RFQ was advertised in the Detroit Legal News and Detroit Public Library Website. In addition, the RFQ was posted on Michigan Intergovernmental Technical Network (MITN). The RFQ included a section on the evaluation criteria by Library administration enabling all bidders to be cognizant of those criteria.

The following firms, with corresponding cost and evaluative values, responded to the RFQ:

<b>Audit Firm</b>	<b>Cost</b>	<b>Evaluative Value</b>
Doeren Mayhew 305 West Big Beaver Road, Suite 200, Troy, MI 48084	\$3,000	86
Abraham & Gaffney, P.C. 3511 Coolidge Road, Suite 100, East Lansing, MI 48823	\$4,700	53
Gregory Terrell & Company 535 Griswold Street, Suite 2000, Buhl Building, Detroit, MI 48226	\$6,345	93
Alan C. Young and Assoc. 7310 Woodward Avenue, Suite 740, Detroit, MI 48202	\$6,600	82

Bids were not received from the following firms:

1. Baker, Tilly, Virchow, Krause, One Town Square, Suite 600, Southfield, MI 48076
2. BDO Seidman LLP - 755 West Big Beaver, Suite 1900, Troy MI 48084-0178
3. Cole, Newton & Duran, 33133 Schoolcraft, Livonia, MI 48150
4. George Johnson & Company - 243 West Congress, Suite 1080, Detroit, MI 48226
5. Glen Olivache CPA - 220 Bagley Avenue, Suite 400, Detroit MI 48226
6. Martin, Arrington, Desai, and Meyers - 1010 Ford Building, 615 Griswold, Detroit, MI 48226
7. Plante Moran, 7310 Woodward Avenue, Detroit, MI 48202

The firms were evaluated by an evaluation team (team) consisting of members of the business office. The team examined each firm according to criteria stated in the RFQ.

Minutes were approved at the June 17, 2014 Commission Meeting

The team examined responsiveness to the RFQ and demonstration of clear understanding of the work to be performed. Additional criteria included: appropriateness and adequacy of proposed procedures such as necessity of procedures, realistic time estimates for completion of the audit, and appropriateness of the assigned staff levels. The team reviewed the technical experience of each firm related to clients with the following characteristics: work with not-for-profit corporations, governmental units and relevant experience for Burton Endowment Fund. The team reviewed the qualifications and experience of management and audit staff assigned to the audit. The cost of the audit was also a consideration in the evaluation. The team submitted its recommendations to the Audit Committee. The Audit Committee made the final selection.

**Abraham & Gaffney** The bidder has audited Burton Endowment Fund for eight (8) fiscal years 2006 to 2013 which exceed the seven (7) year audit term limit established September 17, 2013 by the Detroit Library Commission's Audit Committee. This puts the bidder beyond consideration for fiscal year 2014 audit engagement.

**Alan C. Young & Associates, P.C.** The bidder provides the best combination of experience, resources, qualifications, and price to complete the audit as required. The audit fees were the highest. The bidder was ranked third by the team.

**Doerem Mayhew** The bidder response was general and not specific about the audit. The audit fees were the lowest. The bidder was ranked second by the team.

**Gregory Terrell & Company** The bidder provides the best combination of experience. The bidder has audited Burton Endowment Fund for eight (8) fiscal years 1996 to 2003. The overall evaluation by the team was ranked the highest.

The evaluation team, therefore, recommends that Gregory Terrell & Company be engaged for an amount not to exceed \$6,345 to complete a financial audit of the Burton Endowment Fund for the fiscal year ending June 30, 2014.

## **COMMISSION ACTION**

Commissioner Bellant moved to approve Gregory Terrell & Company to conduct a Financial Audit of Burton Endowment Fund for the Fiscal Year Ending June 30, 2014. Commissioner Thomas supported. The motion passed unanimously.

### **Approval of Proposal for a Financial Audit of the Detroit Library Cooperative for the Fiscal Year Ending June 30, 2014.**

A Request for Quote (RFQ) for a financial audit of Detroit Library Cooperative was sent to twelve (12) auditing firms. The RFQ was advertised in the Detroit Legal News and Detroit Public Library Website. In addition, the RFQ was posted on Michigan Intergovernmental Technical Network (MITN). The RFQ included a section on the evaluation criteria by Library administration enabling all bidders to be cognizant of those criteria.

Minutes were approved at the June 17, 2014 Commission Meeting

The following firms, with corresponding cost and evaluative values, responded to the RFQ:

<b>Audit Firm</b>	<b>Cost</b>	<b>Evaluative Value</b>
Abraham & Gaffney, P.C. 3511 Coolidge Road, Suite 100, East Lansing, MI 48823	\$5,200	55
Gregory Terrell & Company 535 Griswold Street, Suite 2000, Buhl Building, Detroit, MI 48226	\$6,345	93
Alan C. Young and Assoc. 7310 Woodward Avenue, Suite 740, Detroit, MI 48202	\$6,600	81
Rehmann Group 719 Griswold St. Suite 280, Detroit MI 48226	\$7,460	84
Doeren Mayhew 305 West Big Beaver Road, Suite 200, Troy, MI 48084	\$7,500	79

Bids were not received from the following firms:

1. Baker, Tilly, Virchow, Krause, One Town Square, Suite 600, Southfield, MI 48076
2. BDO Seidman LLP - 755 West Big Beaver, Suite 1900, Troy MI 48084-0178
3. Cole, Newton & Duran, 33133 Schoolcraft, Livonia, MI 48150
4. George Johnson & Company - 243 West Congress, Suite 1080, Detroit, MI 48226
5. Glen Olivache CPA - 220 Bagley Avenue, Suite 400, Detroit MI 48226
6. Martin, Arrington, Desai, and Meyers - 1010 Ford Building, 615 Griswold, Detroit, MI 48226
7. Plante Moran, 7310 Woodward Avenue, Detroit, MI 48202

The firms were evaluated by an evaluation team (team) consisting of members of the business office. The team examined each firm according to criteria stated in the RFQ. The team examined responsiveness to the RFQ and demonstration of clear understanding of the work to be performed. Additional criteria included: appropriateness and adequacy of proposed procedures such as necessity of procedures, realistic time estimates for completion of the audit, and appropriateness of the assigned staff levels. The team reviewed the technical experience of each firm related to clients with the following characteristics: work with governmental units and relevant experience for Detroit Library Cooperative. The team reviewed the qualifications and experience of management and audit staff assigned to the audit. The cost of the audit was also a consideration in the evaluation. The team submitted its recommendations to the Audit Committee. The Audit Committee made the final selection.

**Abraham & Gaffney** The bidder has audited Detroit Library Cooperative for seven (7) fiscal years 2007 to 2013. Therefore, the firm has exceeded the seven (7) year audit term limit established by the Detroit Library Commission's Audit Committee on September 17, 2013. This puts the bidder beyond consideration for fiscal year 2014 audit engagement

**Doerem Mayhew** The bidder response was general and not specific about the audit. The audit fees were the highest. The bidder was ranked fourth by the selection team.

**Alan C. Young & Associates, P.C.** The bidder provides the best combination of experience, resources, qualifications, and price to complete the audit as required. The audit fees were the third largest. The bidder was ranked number three by the selection team.

Minutes were approved at the June 17, 2014 Commission Meeting

**Rehmann Group** The bidder has experience with many municipalities and public libraries in three states: Florida, Ohio, and Michigan but the audit fees were the fourth largest. The bidder was ranked second by the selection team.

**Gregory Terrell & Company** The bidder provides the best combination of experience, resources, qualifications, and price to complete the audit as required. The bidder audited Detroit Associated Libraries for nine (9) fiscal years 1995 to 2003. The overall evaluation by the team was ranked the highest.

The evaluation team, therefore, recommends that Gregory Terrell & Company be engaged for an amount not to exceed \$6,345 to complete a financial audit of the Detroit Library Cooperative for the fiscal year ending June 30, 2014.

### **COMMISSION ACTION**

Commissioner Bellant moved to approve Gregory Terrell & Company to conduct a Financial Audit of the Detroit Library Cooperative for the Fiscal Year Ending June 30, 2014. Commissioner Quarterman supported. The motion passed unanimously.

### **COMMITTEE ON BUILDINGS**

#### **Authorization to Replace Water Cooled Condensing Unit at Knapp Branch Library**

Commissioner Thomas reported that the Knapp Branch air conditioning system's water cooled condensing unit froze during a power outage during extreme cold that lasted several days. Knapp is highly utilized and air conditioning is a must.

On April 11, 2014, a Request-For-Proposal for a replacement water cooled condenser, compressor and other related repairs was mailed to local Metro Detroit contractors, posted on the DPL website, published in the Detroit Legal News, the Michigan Chronicle, the Michigan Minority Business Development Council (MMBDC), Michigan Black Chamber of Commerce, Michigan Small Business Bureau and the Construction Association of Michigan (CAM).

There was a mandatory walk through on Tuesday, April 2, 2014, and bids were due on Thursday, May 1, 2014, no later than 2:30 PM.

Out of ten (10) qualified HVAC contractors, two (2) bids were received and there were eight (8) no bids.

Vendor	Bid	Vendor	Bid
Guardian Plumbing & Heating Inc. 34400 Glendale, Livonia, MI 48150	No bid	Complete Mechanical 681 Manufacturers Drive Westland, MI 48186	<b>\$26,567.11</b>
Expert Mechanical Service, Inc. 542 Biddle Ave. Wyandotte, MI 48192	No bid	Tech Mechanical 1490 Highwood East Pontiac, MI 48340	No Bid
Expert Heating & Cooling 24400 Northline Rd. Taylor, MI 48180	No bid	John E. Green 220 Victor Ave Highland Park, MI 48203	<b>\$29,950.00</b>
Supreme Heating & Cooling 14641 East Warren Ave. Detroit, MI 48215	No Bid	Keo & Associates 18286 Wyoming Detroit, MI 48221	No Bid
Temperature Services Inc 37107 Schoolcraft Livonia, MI 48150	No Bid	B & C Ten Air HVAC 3861 Childs Lake Road Milford, MI 48381	No Bid

After thoroughly reviewing the references of the lowest qualified bidder and conferring with the Purchasing Department, the Facilities Department is recommending contracting with Complete Mechanical Contracting, Inc., located in Westland, MI, for the base sum of \$26,567.11.

The Facilities Department is also requesting a Contingency of 15% (\$3,985).

Authorization is requested to contract with Complete Mechanical Contracting, Inc to replace the water cooled condensing unit at the Knapp Branch. The amount is twenty six thousand five hundred and sixty seven dollars and eleven cents (\$26,567.11) plus a 15% contingency of three thousand nine hundred and eight five dollars (\$3,985) for a total amount not to exceed thirty thousand five hundred fifty two dollars and eleven cents (\$30,552.11).

### COMMENT

President Hicks stated that the action taken on this item would be on behalf of the Committee on Buildings and the Committee on Finance because the items were identical.

### COMMISSION ACTION

Commissioner Thomas moved to replace the water cooled condensing unit at Knapp Branch Library. Commissioner Bellant supported. The motion passed unanimously.

## COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

### Approval of Routine Report on Finance

The following accounts have been examined and found correct by the staff of Business and Financial Operations and ratification of payment is recommended.

<u>Summary of Expenditures</u>			
<u>PUBLIC FUNDS</u>			
<u>PAYMENTS PROCESSED BY CITY OF DETROIT</u>			
1. Total Payroll			\$985,103.47
2. Total for Vouchers-processed on DRMS	Vouchers 562 – 642		\$569,823.81
3. Benefits Plan			\$886,511.00
4. General Retirement System			<u>\$295,051.23</u>
		Total Processed by DPL	<u>\$100,193.65</u>
<b>Grand Total</b>			<b><u>\$2,836,683.16</u></b>

Minutes were approved at the June 17, 2014 Commission Meeting

<u>Summary of Expenditures</u>		
<b><u>RESTRICTED/DESIGNATED FUNDS</u></b>		
1. Burton Endowment Checking	Checks 8247 – 8249	\$1,224.00
2. Knight Foundation	Check 1467	\$557.77
3. O'Brien Checking	Checks 4352 – 4368	\$10,895.28
4. Programs & Gifts	Checks 1832 – 1839	<u>\$6,410.94</u>
<b>Grand Total</b>		<b><u>\$19,087.99</u></b>

<b><u>CREDIT CARD EXPENDITURES</u></b>	
Executive Director	\$70.76
Executive Director's Office-used for general office purpose	\$0.00
Deputy Director	\$0.00
Human Resources Department	\$0.00
Marketing Department	\$122.25
Technical Services	\$15,667.01
Facilities Department	\$1,857.29
Credit Card Bank Charges (Miscellaneous credits)	<u>\$0.00</u>
<b>Grand Total</b>	<b><u>\$17,717.31</u></b>

**Note: These are March 2014 credit card purchases**

### **COMMISSION ACTION**

Commissioner Quarterman moved to approve the routine report on finance as presented. Commissioner Bellant supported. The motion passed unanimously.

#### **Authorization to Approve the Resolution to Exempt the Detroit Public Library from the City of Detroit Downtown Authority (DDA), Proposed Amendment and Restated 3800 Woodward Brownfield Redevelopment Plan**

The following resolution was presented to the Commission:

**Whereas**, the mission of the Detroit Public Library (DPL) is to enhance the quality of life for the diverse and dynamic community in the city of Detroit by enlightening and empowering citizens to meet their lifelong learning needs through open and equitable access to information, technology and cultural/educational programs; and

**Whereas**, the DPL's 21 neighborhood branches, Main Library and bookmobiles provide information and technology support that enables Detroiters to meet their everyday living needs; and

**Whereas**, the DPL is able to provide important services as a result of revenue generated from 4.64 mills in property taxes paid by Detroit homeowners, and in FY 2013 this millage generated approximately \$30 million, accounting for 92% of the Library's revenues; and

Minutes were approved at the June 17, 2014 Commission Meeting

**Whereas**, declining property values as well as significant reductions in Detroit's population together have created major revenue shortfalls for the Detroit Public Library; and,

**Whereas**, the DPL recognizes that tax captures provide vital financing to projects that might not progress without that funding and also notes that over the last 15 fiscal years, the Library lost \$34.6 million to tax captures; and,

**Whereas**, the proposed amended and restated 3800 Woodward Brownfield Redevelopment Plan will divert, through tax captures, needed financial resources from the Library and therefore impair the provision of a wide-range of library and information services, including lifelong learning through educational and recreational reading materials, free technology access, one-on-one literacy tutoring, GED preparation, and community programs for children and adults; now be it therefore,

**Resolved**, that the Detroit Library Commission request to opt out of the **Proposed Amended and Restated 3800 Woodward Brownfield Plan**.

### **COMMISSION ACTION**

Commissioner Hicks moved to approve the resolution. Commissioner Bellant supported. The motion passed unanimously.

The meeting was adjourned at 3:40 p.m.