

**DETROIT LIBRARY COMMISSION PROCEEDINGS****SPECIAL MEETING****JULY 9, 2013**

President Bellant called the Special Meeting of the Detroit Library Commission to order at 5:06 p.m.

Present: President Bellant, Commissioners Allen, Hicks, Jackson, Kinloch, Lemmons, Quarterman

Administrative Staff: Mondowney, Machie, Norfolk, Powell

Present Also: Margaret Bruni, A.J. Funchess, Mike McElgunn, Carolyn Mosley, Yvette Rice, Alma Simmons, Laurie Stuart, Larry Teamer, Dorothy J. Williams, Talisha Williams and others

**APPROVAL OF THE FINAL 2013 BUDGET\***

A Public Funds budget of \$32,663,695 for fiscal year 2012-2013 has been adopted by the Detroit City Council. It is a balanced budget.

The benefit package offered to employees for health, welfare and pension is the same for the employees of the City of Detroit. The total number of full-time equivalent positions in the budget for 2012-2013 is 387. There are no salary step or merit increases and vacant positions are budgeted at \$1.

The consolidated budget including Annual Federal Funding, Grants & Gifts, State Aid, Friends Foundation and Knight Foundation amounts to \$36,066,606.

Approval of this budget for inclusion with the Mayor's operational budget for the City of Detroit for fiscal year 2012-2013 is requested.

\*On June 18, 2013 at the Regular scheduled meeting of the Detroit City Council, the request by the Library to amend its FY 2012-2013 budget that was originally submitted in December 2011 was approved. The amendment was necessary because the following expenses: "Workbrain" time and attendance upgrade, \$1 million; the Merit Network, Inc. past due payment, \$365,341; the estimated additional legal fees, \$150,000 due to the ongoing investigation and the insurance deductibles due to pending litigations, \$70,000, were not included in the FY 2012-2013 budget: The additional revenue from the Renaissance Zone Tax in the amount of \$930,086 was also included as part of the amendment. The total amendment was in the amount \$1,585,342.

Minutes were approved at the September 17, 2013 Commission Meeting

## **COMMISSION ACTION**

Commissioner Kinloch made a motion to approve the 2012/2013 budget. Commissioner Lemmons supported. The motion carried unanimously.

### **APPROVAL OF SECURITY CONTRACT – PYRATECH**

A Request for Proposal (RFP) for Security Services at Library Branch locations was published in April 2012: advertised in the *Michigan Chronicle*, *Detroit News*, on the DPL website, and on the website of the *Michigan Minority Business Development Council*. The RFP was also mailed to twenty-eight (28) security companies in Detroit and the surrounding area. The RFP was re-bid in August 2012, following concerns expressed by Library Commissioners.

The results from the August 2012 re-bid were tabulated by the former library security director, and presented to the Committee on Finance through the Purchasing Department in May 2013. The Finance Committee returned the bid results to staff for further review. Public Services convened a team of evaluators to review the bid results. The team comprised: the Assistant Director for Branch Services; the Assistant Director for Main Library; the Assistant Director for Facilities; the Coordinator for Public Services and the Acting Security Manager.

Each of the bids were reviewed and scored by each evaluator, based on the following 14 evaluative criteria, as detailed in the RFP, cost being one of them:

Ability To Meet the Uniformed Security Officers Requirements	Ability To Provide Proof of Quality Assurance Measures
Ability To Provide Necessary Communications	Ability To Provide A Qualified Selection of Security Officers
Ability To Complete Required Training	Ability To Perform Security Officer Duties
Ability To Provide 24/7 Emergency Response & Optional Patrols	Ability To Provide Proper Scheduling & Backup Services
Ability To Create & Provide Post Orders & Security Forms	Provided of References
Provided Proof of Proper Insurance Information	Provided Security Experience, especially in Cultural Settings
Breakdown & Consideration of Cost	Knowledge and understanding of DPL's service environment

Minutes were approved at the September 17, 2013 Commission Meeting

The scores were totaled and averaged to get the scores represented in the table below:

<b>VENDOR</b>	<b>BID AMOUNT</b>	<b>EVALUATIVE SCORE</b>
Pyratech (Detroit, MI)	\$546,624	58.0
Advance (Detroit, MI)	\$509,600	55.8
G4S (Livonia, MI)	\$699,670	54.6
TeachOut (Southfield, MI)	\$527,488	52.2
Guardian (Southfield, MI)	\$561,600	49.0
Allegiance (Harrison Twp., MI)	\$502,444	49.0
Allied Barton(Southfield, MI)	\$732,164	41.2
All Pro (Detroit, MI)	\$415,584	39.8
Securitas (Detroit, MI)	\$510,848	12.0
Council (Detroit, MI)	\$332,800	2.6
RSIG (Southfield, MI)	\$515,616	0 *

RSIG was not rated as the company has since been purchased and absorbed by Guardian. It is the review committee's recommendation to disqualify the two lowest bids and the two highest bids.

Pyratech Security Systems, Inc. (Pyratech) emerged with the highest scores at the end of the review. Pyratech is the current vendor for library branch security services. They have provided branch security services at DPL since 2009. Pyratech's bid of \$546,624 is a 10% reduction from their current contract with DPL. The branch staff, over-all, is pleased with the professional, high-quality services provided. Pyratech has been diligent in addressing any problems that the branch managers and DPL security management have brought to their attention. By continuing with Pyratech, DPL will avoid the long, costly process of training another company to become acclimated to the branches.

Authorization is requested to contract with Pyratech Security Systems, Inc., for security services at library branch locations, for one (1) year with two (2) one- year renewal options, ending June 30, 2016, at an annual cost of \$546,624.00.

### **COMMISSION ACTION**

Commissioner Kinloch made a motion to approve the security contract for Pyratech. Commissioner Quarterman supported.

### **DISCUSSION**

Commissioner Hicks asked the Commission to review a memorandum that he had prepared outlining his opposition of Pyratech Security. He asked the Commission to reject the staff recommendation to award the contract to Pyratech and instead he recommended awarding the contract to Advanced Security, the lowest responsible bidder.

Minutes were approved at the September 17, 2013 Commission Meeting

Commissioner Lemmons said he was concerned with the evaluation process of the security companies. He said when the evaluations were presented to the Committee on Finance at the June 11, 2013 meeting, there were only 3 out of 5 evaluators that completed the evaluations and one evaluator did not score Advanced Security at all. Therefore, there were only 2 completed evaluations because any evaluations that were presented after that would be tainted. He said upon reviewing the 2 completed evaluations, Advanced Security had the highest score.

Commissioner Quarterman said at the June 28, 2013 Committee on Finance meeting, 5 completed evaluations was presented to the members. The Commission should be prepared to vote on rewarding the contract or start the bid process over if they felt this process had been tainted.

President Bellant passed a note to Commissioner Hicks that asked him to clarify his relationship with Freman Hendrix.

Commissioner Hicks explained that he was the Executive Director of the Detroit Charter Commission several years ago and Freman Hendrix was an elected chairperson on the Commission at the time.

Commissioners Quarterman and Lemmons asked what was the relevance of the relationship.

President Bellant explained that the Commission had signed a disclosure agreement at the June 18, 2013 meeting to indicate if they had a relationship with any DPL vendors or employees and Freman Hendrix is the owner of Advanced Security.

Commissioner Kinloch stated that he has known Freman Hendrix for over 15 years but it had nothing to do with the recommendation of the Executive Director and staff to approve the contract for Pyratech that was presented to the Commission. He called for the question.

Commissioner Lemmons objected to the call for the question to end further discussion.

Commissioner Allen said she had researched both Pyratech and Advanced Security companies on the Internet and she found out that Pyratech was a Detroit- based company and the president of the company was a retired Detroit Police Commander. She conducted the same research for Advanced and was unable to get much information other than they were part of a national organization.

Commissioner Quarterman said the Commission asked the staff to provide a recommendation and that recommendation is Pyratech. It was now up to the Commission to either vote it up or down or begin another bid process.

Mrs. Mondowney said over the past months she had visited every branch in the system and, without soliciting information, everyone said they were pleased and felt satisfied with the security staff of Pyratech. She said she trusted staff to make the decision regarding security.

President Bellant said he respected the comments that had been made but he wanted to add caution to the comments that stated the security evaluations were tainted because it implies that someone was doing something unethical or inappropriate. The staff was free to draw their own conclusions and it is unhealthy to imply otherwise.

Commissioner Kinloch left the meeting at 5:50 p.m. but requested to be contacted by telephone for his vote on the motion.

Commissioner Hicks said he thought the work of the staff evaluating the security companies was "sub-par." He felt the contract was being awarded to Pyratech because of their knowledge of DPL's system.

Commissioner Lemmons said he researched Advanced Security and the company was 100% Detroit based and that 95% of the employees were Detroit residents. He did not find out what percentage of Pyratech employees were Detroit residents.

Commissioner Jackson said the Commission gave the staff the task of evaluating the security companies and making a recommendation of who the contract should be awarded to. Therefore, the Commission should trust the staff to make the decision. He said if the Commission trusted the staff, then they should be able to vote for or against the staff's recommendation.

Commissioner Hicks said the staff recommendation of awarding the contract to Pyratech should be rejected and he would offer a motion to award the contract to Advanced Security.

Commissioner Quarterman asked if that could be done at this meeting?

Commissioner Hicks said yes.

### **COMMISSION ACTION CONT'D**

President Bellant called for the question. The motion was to approve the security contract for Pyratech. A roll call vote was taken with the following results:

Commissioner Allen	Yes
Commissioner Hicks	No
Commissioner Jackson	Abstained
Commissioner Kinloch (via telephone)	Yes
Commissioner Lemmons	No
Commissioner Quarterman	Yes
President Bellant	Yes

The motion carried.

### **COMMENT**

Commissioner Hicks said if the Commission had confidence in the staff then DPL would not be part of a federal investigation. In spite of the individual that was being investigated, Commissioner Hicks said he did not believe the individual acted alone. He said the structure of complex organizations, such as the library, have checks and balances. Even if a person did not have criminal intent, the Commission clearly failed on the checks and balances.

Commissioner Hicks said he appreciated and felt the staff was good, however, he was not under any illusion that DPL is in the best possible place in terms of staffing because they are not.

The meeting was adjourned at 6:04 p.m.

