

DETROIT LIBRARY COMMISSION PROCEEDINGS

Special Meeting

May 25, 2010

President Keith called the Special Meeting of the Detroit Library Commission to order at 3:00 p.m.

Present: Commissioners Bellant, Kinloch, Thomas via conference phone, and Otis Mathis, Ex-Officio

Administrative staff: Mondowney, Cromer, Machie, Moore, and Norfolk

Excused: Commissioner Hicks

Present also: Benita Beckles, Margaret Bruni, Randolph Call, Atiim Funchess, Carolyn Mosley, Uzo Onyemaechi, Rosemary Patterson, Cledos Powell, Yvette Rice, Alma Simmons, and Michael Wells, President UAW Local 2200.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Cledos Powell, Facilities Manager, said the roof operations will be shut down tomorrow, Wednesday, May 26, 2010 due the First Lady's visit at WSU and the DIA.

REPORT OF COMMITTEE

COMMITTEE ON ADMINISTRATION

Approval to Contract for Legal Services

Commissioner Kinloch reported that in February 2010, DPL sent an RFP for Legal Services to 27 law firms in Southeast Michigan. Additionally, the notice of the RFP was published in the Michigan Chronicle, the Detroit Legal News and on DPL's website. The following firms received the RFP:

Dykema Gossett, PLLC, Detroit, MI
Warner Norcross & Judd, LLP, Southfield, MI
Berry Moorman, Detroit, MI
Bodman LLP, Detroit, MI
Bowman & Brooke LLP, Troy, MI

Minutes approved at June 15, 2010 DLC Meeting.

Butzel Long, Detroit, MI
Charfoos & Christensen PC, Detroit MI
Cox, Hodgman & Giarmarco, P.C., Detroit, MI
Detroit Litigation Firm, Detroit, MI
Dickinson Wright PLLC, Detroit, MI
Feikens, Stevens, Kennedy & Galbraith, P.C., Detroit, MI
Foley & Lardner LLP, Detroit, MI
Garan, Lucow, Miller & Seward, P.C., Detroit, MI
Gurewitz & Raben, PLC, Detroit, MI
Hall, Render, Killian, Heath & Lyman Professional Services Corporation, Detroit, MI
Honigman Miller Schwartz and Cohn, Detroit, MI
Jaffe, Raitt, Heur & Weiss, Detroit, MI
Kitch Drutchas Wagner Valitutti & Sherbrook, Detroit, MI
Law Offices of Zaher & Levi, Detroit, MI
LeClair Ryan, Detroit, MI
Littler Mendelson, PC, Detroit, MI
Miller Canfield, Detroit, MI
Miller Cohen, PLC, Detroit, MI
Paul M. Hughes, Detroit, MI
Pepper Hamilton LLP, Detroit, MI
Plunkett & Cooney, P.C., Detroit, MI
The Jacques Admiralty Law Firm, Detroit, MI

Four firms responded to the RFP:

Berry Moorman , Detroit
\$148.75 - \$255/hr attorneys

Butzel Long Attorneys and Counselors, Detroit
\$200/hr Blended rate/partners & associates
\$225/hr/ shareholder
\$180/hr/associate
\$125/hr/paralegal
Dickinson Wright PLLC, Detroit
\$295/hr Blended rate/members and of counsel attorneys
\$225/hr associate
\$95/hr paralegal

Kitch Drutchas Wagner Valitutti & Sherbrook, Detroit
\$170/hr Blended rate
\$150 - \$190/hour/attorneys
\$100/hr paralegal

The proposals were reviewed and ranked by the evaluation team consisting of the Executive Director, Deputy Director, Chief Administrative Officer and Human Resources Director. Areas for evaluation were: experience, qualifications, capacity of firm &

assigned personnel, organization & quality of proposal, references and fees. (See Appendix A for actual form.) The firms were ranked as follows:

1. Dickinson Wright PLLC
2. Butzel Long Attorneys and Counselors
3. Kitch Drutchas Wagner Valitutti & Sherbrook
4. Berry Moorman

Dickinson Wright (DW) PLLC's proposal was comprehensive and reflective of its ability to provide legal services that will support the Detroit Public Library. The firm's attorneys have extensive experience in the areas of real estate, human resources, labor relations, corporate/business, public finance law and municipal law. Dickinson Wright's proposal was very responsive to the "Scope of Services" outlined in the RFP and the firm has the requisite "demonstrable qualifications to handle a wide range of legal work."

Commissioner Kinloch moved to approve contracting with Dickinson Wright PLLC for legal services. The contract will not exceed two years, at which time DPL will send an RFP for legal services. Commissioner Bellant seconded the motion; the motion carried.

The meeting was adjourned at 3:08 p.m.

APPENDIX A-EVALUATION FORM
Evaluation of Legal Services Proposals
Detroit Public Library

FIRM:

Evaluator Name/Date:

Rating 1 – 5, 1 = Poor; 5 =Excellent. Rate and Comment.

1. **Experience** : Rating: ____

2. **Qualifications**: Rating: ____

3. **Capacity of Firm & Assigned Personnel**: Rating: ____

4. **Overall organization and quality of proposal**, including cohesiveness, conciseness and clarity
Rating: ____

5. **References**: Rating: ____

6. **Fees**: Rating: ____

RATING TOTAL:

7. **Additional Comments**